

Running Head: Recruitment Limitation in Ant Populations

**RECRUITMENT LIMITATION AND POPULATION DENSITY**  
**IN THE HARVESTER ANT,**  
***POGONOMYRMEX OCCIDENTALIS***

**Blaine J. Cole**

**Department of Biology and Biochemistry**

**University of Houston**

**Houston, Texas USA 77204-5513**

**Diane C. Wiernasz**

**Department of Biology and Biochemistry**

**University of Houston**

**Houston, Texas USA 77204-5513**

**Email: [bcole@uh.edu](mailto:bcole@uh.edu)**

**Abstract:**

We present evidence that the population density of *P. occidentalis* is largely determined by recruitment limitation, and demonstrate that variation in population density is a function of the dispersal patterns of foundress queens. The density of established colonies, the number of new colonies, and the number of foundress queens are all highly correlated in this population. The density of foundress queens predicts the density of new colonies in the following year. The density of propagules (foundress queens), new colonies and established colonies is significantly negatively correlated with the distance from the mating site that is the source of the propagules, and the distance from this source can be used to predict the local density of new and established colonies in this population. Finally, we show that addition of foundress queens significantly increases the number of new colonies in supplemented versus control plots. At the level of the landscape, the population is a mixture of areas with low and high density, with no evidence of overall density dependence. Density dependence is evident only in local areas that receive sufficient propagules. The relative importance of density-dependent factors in this population depends on the location of plots with respect to the source of propagules.

Key Words: population density, recruitment limitation, density dependence, ants, density independence

## **Introduction**

Ecologists have long been interested in how local density is determined in populations (Elton 1927). Density variation can occur as a consequence of local variation in habitat quality. Habitats can vary in quality due to resource differences (e.g. Tilman 1982, Lehman and Tilman 1997), the presence or absence of predators (e.g. Morin 1983, Sousa and Mitchell 1999) or competitors (e.g. Silander and Pacala 1985, Pacala and Silander 1985, 1990, Schmitt and Holbrook 1999) and local variation in the scale and intensity of disturbance (e.g. Denslow 1987, 1995, Coffin et al 1996, Dalling et al 1998, Hubbell et al 1999). Organism survival or habitat selection may result from intrinsic differences in the habitats.

Alternatively, many studies have shown that patterns of immigration or emigration can influence local variation in density (e.g. Hubbell et al 1990, Matthysen 1999). A number of studies on coral reef fish, marine invertebrates and trees have suggested that, in some species, the supply of propagules can limit recruitment to the population and thus determine population density (Doherty and Fowler 1994, Roughgarden et al. 1985, Roughgarden et al. 1988, Pacala and Hurtt 1995, Caley et al. 1996, Hubbell et al. 1999). Recruitment in these systems is decoupled from local processes; new recruits into a population are not found near their source. In several species of barnacles and other marine invertebrates (Gaines, et al 1985, Roughgarden, et al 1988, Possingham and Roughgarden 1990, Stoner 1990, Gaines and Bertness 1992), chronic and consistent limitation of recruitment at specific locations maintains population density below the level that available resources can support.

In mobile organisms, density variation may be a function not only of recruitment, but the degree of habitat selection and the ease with which individuals can move between sites. In

organisms with a sessile stage, such as plants, many intertidal marine invertebrates or ants, dispersal is limited to one stage in the life cycle: pollen or seeds, planktonic larvae or dispersing queens. In such organisms habitat selection or the movement of dispersing recruits may have long-lasting consequences. Substantial density variation in sessile taxa may be due to intrinsic differences in the local site or to differences in the ability of organisms to reach the site. For example, spatial variation in the availability of resources may either permit higher local density at some sites, or may attract larger numbers of individuals that are capable of choosing among habitats. Even without habitat selection, if propagules are localized, then variation in population density may be due to variation in the numbers of individuals that arrive at a site. In this scenario, variation in local densities arise because some sites simply receive more propagules than others. If the propagule supply is low enough it can limit recruitment and even in long-lived organisms the habitat will not be saturated and density dependence will not be observed.

The circumstance where density dependence may only be apparent at high densities has often been referred to as density-vague (Strong 1984, Roughgarden 1997, Turchin 1999). When the density of recruits is so high that it saturates the habitat, further increases in the supply of recruits should not change population density. Below the saturation point, however, a decrease or increase in the density of recruits will produce a corresponding decrease or increase in population density. Above this saturation point, the populations should show evidence of density dependence.

Two alternate explanations, differences in habitat quality or differences in recruitment, can account for variation in the local population density of a sessile organism. This is probably a false dichotomy, and in many systems we expect that both mechanisms operate (Chesson 1998). A

more appropriate question is how much of the variation in density is due to variation in recruitment versus variation in habitat quality. Spatial variation in recruitment will produce several patterns. First, the number of recruits and the number of adults will have a consistent, long-term correlation; areas with high population density will have high numbers of recruits. Because variation in habitat quality can also produce this pattern, a correlation by itself is not sufficient evidence of recruitment limitation. Second, there will be a geographical feature that promotes or interferes with dispersal, causing consistent variation in the number of propagules arriving at certain locations, ultimately determining density. Third, since resource availability and reproduction play a subsidiary role to dispersal in determining population density, there will only be evidence for local density dependence and spatial variation in the importance of density dependence. Finally, it should be possible to increase population density in some areas by experimentally manipulating the number of propagules at sites that have low density. The last three correlates distinguish recruitment limitation from variation in habitat quality.

Because ants can have high population densities and are territorial and aggressive, they have often considered to be a group whose density is limited by space or resources (Hölldobler and Wilson 1990). Ants can affect the local resource base (Porter et al 1988; Porter and Savignano 1990; Davidson et al. 1980), they interact aggressively both within and between species (Hölldobler 1976; Cole 1983; Gordon and Kulig 1996) and are frequently characterized by uniform spatial distributions (Levings and Traniello 1981; Levings and Franks 1982).

Many species of ants, however, have a life cycle that is similar to the open population structure that typifies many marine species. In these ant species, reproduction occurs in large mating swarms that are localized in the landscape and queens subsequently disperse from these

point sources. The habit of localized mating and dispersal effectively decouples local offspring production (of queens and males) from local propagule acquisition (return of dispersing queens). Because there is a dispersive juvenile stage and a sessile adult stage, there is a possibility that local population density may be affected by the availability of recruits.

We evaluated the importance of variation in recruitment for variation in population density in the harvester ant, *Pogonomyrmex occidentalis*. We compared the density of foundress queens (propagules), one-year old colonies (recruits) and established colonies (more than one year old) as a function of distance from dispersal sites to determine how propagule supply affects colony density. In low density areas we supplemented propagules to try to increase recruitment. We used three fitness correlates to look for evidence of density dependent processes at local scales.

## **Materials and Methods**

*P. occidentalis* is a seed harvesting species that is frequently abundant in the arid lands of western North America. Colonies are uniformly distributed, although there is considerable variation in population density (Wiernasz and Cole 1995). *P. occidentalis* is a swarm mating species: queens fly to hilltop mating aggregations from their natal colony, and disperse individually after mating to commence solitary colony-founding (Nagel and Rettenmeyer 1973, Hölldobler 1976, Wiernasz and Cole 1995, Wiernasz et al.1995). Mating flights are triggered by midsummer rainfall. In western Colorado, where this work was conducted, *P. occidentalis* typically has one or two mating flights that may occur from late June to early August (Wiernasz et al.1995, Abell et al. 1999).

The mating system of *P. occidentalis* decouples local reproduction from local recruitment. The two stages of queen dispersal, flight from their natal colony to hilltops and flight from the mating swarm back to the general population, make it highly unlikely that foundresses establish colonies near their natal nest. Colonies are founded by single, multiply mated queens (Cole and Wiernasz 1999, 2000a). Unlike some ant species (Hölldobler and Wilson 1990), *P. occidentalis* does not reproduce by budding from established colonies, nor are queens accepted back into their natal nest. In an electrophoretic study of a large population of 960 colonies at this site, we found no evidence of population subdivision (Cole and Wiernasz 1997). Thus, recruitment does not occur in the vicinity of the natal site.

This work was conducted in near Fruita (Mesa Co.), Colorado (39 16' N, 108 45' W) in a study site of approximately 29 hectares in which all colonies of *P. occidentalis* are permanently marked and mapped (Wiernasz and Cole 1995). The study area is subdivided into 135 50 m x 50 m (quarter hectare) plots. Of the total plots, 92 are entirely contained within the study site, i.e., not located on the edge of the study site. The entire site was initially censused (1992) for all colonies, and then for new colonies and mortality of established colonies in annual censuses (June/July) during the next five years (1993-97). A small proportion of colonies relocate in any year (about 1%). These colonies can be easily distinguished from new colony establishment by their larger size and the co-occurrence of colony abandonment and colony appearance. Colonies were measured each year to determine size and growth (Wiernasz and Cole 1995). Colonies, queen burrows, and hilltops are mapped with a Leica TC600 Total Station to within 0.03 m from permanent benchmarks established on the study plot.

In this study we define the local neighborhood as the collection of individuals that shares the same ecological site characteristics and which can directly interact with one another. For different organisms, this means different scales of interaction. We have used 0.25 ha plots to subdivide the study site and approximate the local neighborhood. At our study site, these plots are also fairly homogeneous in vegetation and topography (over the scales on which the ants forage). Mean nearest neighbor distances between colonies is 9.2 m ( $\pm$  4.1 sd, N = 771), and the maximal foraging range is about 30 m, so that colonies on this spatial scale are capable of interacting with one another. Plots of this size also have historical precedents in other studies of desert granivores (e.g. Davidson et al 1985, Brown and Munger 1985, Munger and Brown 1980).

We subdivided the life-cycle of *P. occidentalis* into three stages: queens founding nests, new colonies, and established colonies. Foundress queens begin colonies singly by excavating a burrow that is the nascent nest. The number of queen burrows on a plot established the number of propagules arriving locally. New colonies are those which have survived to one year old. We used the number of new colonies in a plot as a measure of recruitment. Established colonies are older than one year, and defined the local population density.

#### Spatial analyses of recruitment limitation

To determine whether spatial variation in recruitment occurred in our population, we selected 20 plots that spanned the range of local neighborhood densities at our site. Because we wanted to minimize problems that might arise from spatial autocorrelation, we chose plots that were not adjacent. The number of propagules was determined by censusing the queen burrows on each plot after two reproductive flights that occurred on 29 June 1996 and 18 July 1996. Queen burrows are distinguished by the characteristic shape of the entrance hole and the



excavated soil. Data from the two queen burrow censuses are combined in this study. To ensure that data were independent, we examined the relation between plot density at the start of the study in 1992 (the range of densities was 5-24 colonies, median = 12), the total number of new colonies (total recruitment) that appeared in a plot in 1993-96 (the range of total recruitment was 0-16 colonies, median = 8), the number of queen burrows in 1996 (the range of propagules was 28- 276 burrows, median = 89), and the number of new colonies in 1997 (range of recruitment 0-4 colonies, median = 1).

The density in 1992 is independent of the recruitment of new colonies in the period 1993-1996 which is independent of the number of queens arriving at a site in 1996. In this paper we use density in 1992 as the sole independent measure of density for analyzing fitness correlates. Since we have density measures for each year we could use average density over the study period, or make separate comparisons for each year. In the first case, density is not independent of subsequent recruitment, and in the second case density and therefore the comparisons are not independent across years. Similar consideration of the need for independence of recruitment and queen density led us to restrict the measures of recruitment to 1993-1996.

Because the queens disperse from hilltops we regressed the number of established colonies, the number of new colonies, and the number of queen burrows in each plot on the distance from each plot to the hilltops. We used the seven hills within and surrounding the study site that were the site of mating swarms in at least one previous year of the study. One hill had mating swarms in every year while others may have had a mating swarm in only one year. We expected that proximity to a hilltop would be associated with increased density of propagules, recruits, or established colonies, and therefore predicted a negative regression of density on

distance and used one-tailed tests. To compensate for multiple comparisons, we applied a Bonferonni correction to establish significance levels.

### Propagule supplementation experiments

Beginning in 1997 we introduced queens into plots historically characterized by low recruitment. Queens were collected *in copula* at a very large mating swarm located 6 km N of the study site, and held individually in vials in coolers until dusk when they were released into plots. In 1997 we introduced queens individually into 20 cm diameter arenas placed within three plots that historically had low recruitment (the number of new colonies 1993-1996  $\leq 5$ ). Queens were allowed to dig within the arena during the evening after their mating flight; the arena was removed after two days. The three supplemented plots, which each received 100 queens, were paired with a non-supplemented control plot within 100 meters that also had a history of low recruitment. In 1998 we placed 200 queens into the central 20m x 20m of each of eight plots (including the three used in 1997) without using an arena to confine the queen. We found this to be a more satisfactory technique, because it allowed the queens to select their own site for establishing the nest. Queens could move, although observations suggested that they did not fly and probably did not move enough to leave the plot. After release at dusk, queens usually ran into vegetation or into cracks in the soil. Each supplement plot was paired with a control plot as above. The experiment was repeated on the same eight pairs of plots in 1999, except that in 1999 we only added 100 queens to each experimental plot. The population level of reproduction was dramatically lower in 1999, which reduced the number of queens available for supplementation. To determine whether queen supplements increased the number of queens attempting to start nests on a plot, the number of queen burrows was counted in six pairs of plots

in 1998 within one week of queen addition and was significantly larger in supplemented plots ( $t = 3.60$ ,  $df = 5$ ,  $p = 0.008$ , one-tailed). Rainstorms erased evidence of queen burrows before all eight pairs of plots could be monitored. The average increase in the number of queen burrows in supplemented plots was 42 queens. Queen burrows were not counted in 1997 or 1999. Control and experimental plots were monitored for new colonies early in the summer of the following year (1998-2000); the number of new colonies ranged from 0-3 (median = 0). We analyzed the data by computing the mean number of new colonies in each plot and tested the effect of supplements with a one-tailed Wilcoxon matched-pairs ranked sum test, because we expected queen addition to increase recruitment.

#### Analyses for density dependence

In each of the plots used in the study of spatial variation in recruitment (see above), we quantified three correlates of fitness. Mortality rate was measured as the cumulative probability of colony death over four years of this study. Since the probability of reproduction is a function of colony size (Cole and Wiernasz, 2000b) we used both nest size and colony growth as fitness measures. Nest size, an estimate of the number of workers, is the ln-transformed product of the length, width and height of the nest cone (Wiernasz and Cole 1995, Cole and Wiernasz 2000b); growth is the difference in nest cone size in consecutive years. Because colony growth is a function of colony size (Cole and Wiernasz 1999), we first regressed growth on size for colonies from the entire study area ( $N = 965$ ), and then used the residuals of this regression as the standardized growth rate for each colony.

In a stable population, one new colony must be established over the average lifespan of a colony. If a local neighborhood is saturated, the density is so high that further increases in the

supply of propagules cannot change neighborhood density. If local neighborhood density is not saturated, then there is a balance between recruitment and mortality, and the observed density should be predicted by the number of propagules landing in a neighborhood. Increases in the number of propagules should result in increased recruitment and local density. The predicted y-intercept of this regression is zero. The reciprocal of the probability that a queen establishes a colony ( $p$ ) is the number of queens that must land on a plot to replace a single colony. Dividing this number by the average lifespan ( $L$ ) of a colony yields the number of queens that must land annually to sustain this rate ( $1/Lp$ ). The reciprocal of the number of propagules that must land annually ( $Lp$ ) is the expected slope of the regression of colony density on propagule number when density is not saturated. If local population density is saturated, then differences in the number of propagules will not be related to density. In this case we predict no relation between the observed population density and the density of the propagules. Since the local population density is stable, it is only in saturated plots that we should see evidence for density dependence.

We used the distribution of propagules arriving at a plot to categorize them as unsaturated or saturated. Our simple criterion was that a plot that received fewer than the median number of propagules was more likely to be unsaturated while a plot that received more than the median number of propagules was more likely to be saturated. The saturated density was defined as the mean density on plots that received more than the median number of propagules. The average life expectancy in this population is known ( $L = 17$  years =  $1/\text{annual probability of mortality}$  [Wiernasz and Cole 1995]). We determined the probability that a propagule produced a recruit, and calculated the relation between the number of propagules and expected population density. We then repeated our analyses of density dependence using only saturated plots.

## Results

The primary requirement for demonstrating spatial variation in recruitment limitation is to show that the density of recruits (new colonies) is associated with propagule density (queen burrows). The density of queen burrows should predict the density of new colonies, and if this is a chronic pattern, the density of new colonies should correlate with the density of established colonies. The number of queen burrows in a plot in 1996 predicted the number of new colonies produced in 1997 ( $\text{Recruits} = 0.14 + 0.013 \cdot [\text{Queens}]$ ,  $r^2 = 0.35$ ,  $P = 0.006$ ,  $N = 20$ ). If this relationship is forced through zero, and analyzing the relationship as a mixture model (Wilkinson 1996, pp. 290-291), the relation is essentially unchanged ( $\text{Recruits} = 0.014 \cdot [\text{Queens}]$ ,  $r^2 = 0.35$ ,  $P < 0.0001$ ,  $N = 20$ ). This relationship is consistent: the correlation between the number of propagules (queen burrows) in 1996 and the establishment of new colonies over the prior four-year period 1993-96 is highly significant ( $r = 0.67$ ,  $P = 0.001$ ,  $N = 20$ , Fig 1a). The correlation between the number of new colonies established in 1993-96 and established colony density in 1992 is also highly significant ( $r = 0.74$ ,  $P < 0.001$ ,  $N = 20$ , Fig 1b). When we look at the correlation across the entire 29 ha study site, using only intact plots to ameliorate edge effects, the relationship between recruitment during 1993-1996 and colony density in 1992 is also very strong ( $r = 0.56$ ,  $P < 0.0001$ ,  $N = 92$ , Fig. 1c). These relationships suggest that differences in local population density are associated with long term differences in the abundance of propagules.

We tested for a relationship between distance to potential mating swarm hills and initial colony density in 1992, recruitment during 1993-1996 and queen burrow density in 1996. We expected that if the distance to the hill was important, that there would be a significant negative regression of the density parameter on distance (as the distance to a hill decreases the effect of the

hill should increase). The regression of the density parameter on the distance to Hill 7 was significant in all cases: colony density ( $P = 0.025$ , Fig 2a, in all cases  $N = 20$ , one-tailed test, with Bonferonni correction due to regression to seven different hills), the total number of newly established colonies at the site ( $P = 0.023$ , Fig. 2b) and the number of queens at a site ( $P = 0.036$ , Fig 2c). For all other hills, the one-tailed Bonferonni corrected probabilities are  $P > 0.6$ .

Not only are all population parameters related to the distance from Hill 7, they show concordant relationships. Using the relationship between queen burrow density and distance from this hill, we estimated that the distance beyond which no queens are expected to arrive from Hill 7 to be 810 meters. Using the relationship of new colonies as a function of distance from this hill, we estimated that the distance beyond which no new colonies are expected is 730 meters. Using the relationship of established colony density (in 1992) as a function of distance from this hill, we estimated that the distance beyond which density falls to zero is 860 meters. These distance estimates suggest that 730-860 meters is the neighborhood radius that is relevant for  $P$ .

*occidentalis* population structure. Of course factors such as local wind conditions on the day of the flight will modify this estimate for queen density, but should not affect colony density or the density of new colonies.

Although the correlation of population parameters with the distance from Hill 7 is high, it may be coincidental. To determine whether this location is unusual (and biologically meaningful), we calculated the correlation between the colony density, the density of new colonies, the number of queen burrows, and the distance to 5,041 locations ( $=71^2$ ) on 20 m grid intervals in a 1.4 km x 1.4 km area surrounding the study site. This additional area includes many other hills, although none which are as tall as Hill 7. The size of the correlation of the population parameter with

distance to a location is color coded in Figure 3. A single region shows the largest negative correlation with the density of queens (Fig. 3a), newly established colonies (Fig 3b), and established colonies (Fig. 3c). The region which could have produced simultaneously highly significant correlations ( $P < 0.01$ ) for all population parameters is the relatively small area in Figure 3d which contains Hill 7.

The distance to Hill 7 has predictive value as well. Using the same methods we employed for selecting the initial 20 plots, we selected twenty additional plots from the study area and predicted the population density in 1992 and total recruitment from 1993-1997 using the known regression of initial density or recruitment on distance from the lek hill. The correlation of observed and predicted values was highly significant for both stages (total recruitment,  $r = 0.61$ ,  $P < 0.005$ ; initial density,  $r = 0.78$ ,  $P = 0.0001$ ).

Queen supplementation significantly increased the number of newly founded colonies (Wilcoxon matched-pairs signed rank test,  $p = 0.013$ , one-tailed). Five new colonies appeared on the control plots while 17 new colonies were produced on the supplemented plots. With a total of 2700 queens added to the supplemented plots, and 12 additional colonies produced, the overall average probability of successfully founding a colony was 0.004. This figure may underestimate the probability of success because we did not know how many of the additional queens began nest burrows. For 1998, using the estimate of 42 additional queens per supplemented plot (or approximately 336 additional queens) we found that the estimated success rate of queens in supplemented plots was 0.015. (There were five additional colonies established on experimental plots relative to control plots in 1998.) This latter number was comparable to the natural success

rate observed by Wiernasz and Cole (1995) and from the regression of new colonies on queen burrows reported above.

Because the supply of propagules (foundress queens) strongly influences population density in *P. occidentalis*, we predicted that there would be no overall relationship between measures of colony fitness and population density. As correlates of colony fitness, we used the plot-specific mortality rate, average colony size and average colony growth for the 20 study plots. Density was not correlated with mortality ( $r = 0.15$ ,  $P > 0.25$ ,  $N = 20$ , all one-tailed tests), colony size ( $r = -0.10$ ,  $P > 0.2$ ,  $N = 20$ ) or colony growth ( $r = -0.19$ ,  $P > 0.2$ ,  $N = 20$ ). Neither was the distance to the tallest lek hill correlated with any of these measures: mortality ( $r = 0.09$ ,  $P > 0.5$ ,  $N = 20$ ), colony size ( $r = -0.23$ ,  $P > 0.25$ ,  $N = 20$ ) or growth ( $r = -0.11$ ,  $P > 0.5$ ,  $N = 20$ ).

Based on the average colony lifetime of 17 years, and the probability that a queen can found a colony ( $p = 0.013$ , reported above), we estimated that 77 queens (an average of 4.52 queens/colony/year) must land on a plot to replace each colony. The median density of propagules in 1996 was 89 queen burrows/plot. The average density of colonies in plots with more than the median level of propagules was 17.8 colonies/quarter hectare; we used this as the estimate of saturated density. To maintain this density, 81 queens/year must land on a quarter hectare plot; plots receiving fewer propagules would not be saturated and may be limited by recruitment.

We tested whether we could predict the observed density of colonies based on the availability of propagules. For unsaturated plots receiving fewer than 81 propagules, there was a significant regression ( $P < 0.01$ ) of observed colony density (mean = 10.8 colonies) on the number of propagules (Figure 4). The slope ( $0.30 \pm 0.09$  se) did not differ from the expected value of



0.22 (= pL) and the y-intercept ( $-4.53 \pm 4.8$ ) did not differ significantly from zero. On plots that received more than 81 propagules, there was no relationship between the observed colony density and estimated colony density that would result from (Figure 4). The mean observed colony density was  $14.3 \pm 5.8$  colonies, which did not differ significantly from the estimated value of 17.8 colonies.

Although our data did not show density-dependence when all plots are considered, we predicted that density-dependence should be more apparent in plots that receive enough propagules to saturate density. We found a negative correlation between density and colony size ( $r = -0.63$ ,  $P = 0.026$ , one-tailed test); correlations between density and mortality ( $r = 0.28$ ,  $P > 0.2$ ) and density and growth ( $r = -0.22$ ,  $P > 0.25$ ,  $N$  for all = 10), although in the expected direction, were not significant.

## **Discussion**

Our results are most simply explained as recruitment limitation: locations close to the site of the mating swarm are more easily reached by dispersing queens and have a higher local population density. The decline in foundress density with distance from the mating swarm is consistent with patterns of dispersal in other insect species (reviewed in Turchin 1998) as well as trees whose seeds are wind dispersed (Greene and Johnson 1989). Annual variation in food availability will affect the number of reproductives produced by individual colonies, and consequently variation in the number of foundress queens. However, the large-scale, long-term pattern of population density should reflect the long term average distribution of propagules in the landscape.

Habitat selection by queens may contribute to the pattern of foundress settlement. Queen distribution is highly clumped (Cole and Wiernasz, submitted), suggesting that they actively select nest sites at the level of microsites. But in order for habitat selection to be solely responsible for the patterns of distribution, some as yet unquantified environmental feature must be a function of the distance to Hill 7, and dispersal itself must be independent of the distance to Hill 7. While we do not rule out habitat selection, limited dispersal from a single source is sufficient to explain the patterns we observe.

The spatial pattern of density is truly a landscape property that will be produced spontaneously by the interaction of queen movement and the attractiveness of hilltops for the formation of mating swarms. If sites vary in their attractiveness for mating, this will generate spatial pattern in density even if the initial density of colonies is completely uniform. More attractive sites for mating will be the foci for density increase. Increased density around attractive mating sites creates a positive feedback to produce spatial organization spontaneously. If the density of attractive sites is high, there may still be spatial variation in density as a function of recruitment limitation. Even if all places are near a suitable mating site, diffusive instabilities (Kareiva 1990, p.58-59) may spontaneously produce persistent spatial patterns. But, if the distance between attractive sites is on the order of the dispersal distance, then density variation is easily produced on larger spatial scales. The pattern of abundance in this species may not be understandable without reference to the presence of subtle geographical features.

Overall population density is an outcome of processes that occur on a large number of local scales. Assuming that queens move the same distance when traveling to the mating swarm as when they disperse from the mating swarm, the distance over which the queens disperse to new

nest sites (approximately 800 meters), determines the set of local neighborhoods that contribute to a single mating swarm. In some neighborhoods, density dependent processes may occur, while others lack evidence of density dependence. In effect, the variation in local neighborhood density is erased when all of the queens disperse first to the lek site for mating and then away from it for colony-founding. This is a spatial version of the storage effect hypothesis (Chesson 1985) for a single species. The storage effect hypothesis suggests that temporal, particularly annual, variation in density due to variations in reproduction is damped by storage of propagules in something like a seed bank.

Studies of the importance of scale in ecology have often compared the evidence for density-dependence (reviewed by Ray and Hastings 1996, Williams and Liebhold 2000), at local scales and at larger scales in a hierarchical analysis. Differences in the significance of local and higher scales of comparison have been often been observed. In immobile insect stages evidence for density dependence was found in 7-16% of studies at larger spatial scales while 65-69% of studies showed density dependence at smaller spatial scales (Ray and Hastings 1996). We suggest that scale is important in a different way in this system. The relevant scale over which density dependence can operate is always local. Scale becomes important relative to the distance from a source of propagules. When the distance from the source is small enough to ensure that a local neighborhood is saturated in density, we see evidence of density dependence. Increasing the distance from the source of propagules reduces the evidence of density dependence. Scale is not used hierarchically, but as a way of establishing categories such as saturated versus unsaturated plots. If a hierarchical analysis of scale was used in the present study, the evidence for density dependence would depend critically on the mixture of saturated and unsaturated local sites. In

species where spatial variation in density is influenced by recruitment, hierarchical aggregation of local neighborhoods may be misleading.

This type of spatial analysis might be profitably applied to other systems. For example, habitat fragmentation or disturbance may produce edge habitats that contain populations with different demography (mortality and fecundity schedules). To determine the spatial scale of disturbance that influences the population ecology of the organism, one might compare demographic properties inside and outside a proposed disturbance scale or distance. When the scale of classification is appropriate to the scale of disturbance, one may observe shifts in demography.

Recruitment limitation has been widely reported in marine systems and may be of considerable importance to the population dynamics of some marine species (Caley et al. 1996). Limited recruitment also may explain the diversity of tropical and temperate forests (Schup 1990; Alvarez-Buylla and Garcia-Barrios 1993; Hurtt and Pacala 1995; Hubbell et al. 1999). Species that display recruitment limitation share certain life history features: a highly dispersive stage, usually the juveniles, and a sedentary stage that decouples local recruitment from local reproduction. Because a number of terrestrial species, especially insects and plants, have these characteristics, recruitment limitation may be frequent in these systems.

Ants have been a paradigmatic example of species whose populations are limited by space and resource availability. Several studies have shown both intraspecific (De Vita 1979; Ryti and Case 1984, 1992; Gordon and Kulig 1996) and interspecific (Vepsäläinen and Pisarski 1982; Cole 1983) competition. The regularity of colony dispersion patterns is attributed to intense intraspecific competition (Levings and Traniello 1981; Ryti and Case 1986). Ants are among the

most frequent examples of insect species that show strong competition for food resources (Davidson 1985). This study suggests that resource or scramble competition for food or space is not the fundamental factor determining population density in *P. occidentalis*. While there may be competition for space and/or food (Gordon and Kulig 1996), it acts secondarily on the distribution of foundresses generated by the spatial distribution of mating swarms.

## **Acknowledgments**

We thank G. Wellington, S. Gaines, E. Siemann, L. Guttierrez, I. Billick, H. Possingham and A. Abell for helpful discussions and comments on earlier versions of the paper. We especially thank one of the anonymous reviewers for comments which greatly improved the final manuscript. We thank E. Hobson, J. Yencharis, J. Villinski, K. Miller, C. Kracht, B. Mallberg, L. Haak, M. Hayden and K. Haight for field assistance. This work was supported by NSF DEB-9509312 and IBN-9507470 to B. J. C. and D. C. W., NSF BSR-9108034 to D. C. W., and the University of Houston Coastal Center.

## Literature Cited

- Alvarez-Buylla, E and R. Garcia-Barrios. 1993. Models of patch dynamics in tropical forests. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution*. 8:201-204.
- Billick, I., D.C. Wiernasz and B.J. Cole. Submitted. Spatial variation and density dependent recruitment in the harvester ant, *Pogonomyrmex occidentalis*. *Oecologia* (in press).
- Brown, J. H. and J. C. Munger. 1985. Experimental manipulation of a desert rodent community: food addition and species removal. *Ecology* 66:1545-1563.
- Caley, M.J., et al. 1996. Recruitment and the local dynamics of open marine populations. *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics* 27:477-500.
- Chesson, P. 1985. Coexistence of competitors in spatially and temporally varying environments: a look at the combined effects of different sorts of variability. *Theoretical Population Biology* 28:263-287.
- Chesson, P. 1998. Recruitment limitation: a theoretical perspective. *Australian Journal of Ecology*. 23:234-240.
- Coffin, D.P., W. K. Laurenroth and I. C. Burke. 1996. Recovery of vegetation in a semiarid grassland 53 years after disturbance. *Ecol. Appl.* 6:538-555.
- Cole, B.J. 1983. Assembly of mangrove ant communities: patterns of geographical distribution. *Journal of Animal Ecology*. 52: 339-347
- Cole, B. J. and D. C. Wiernasz. 1997. Inbreeding in a lek-mating ant species, *Pogonomyrmex occidentalis*. *Behavioural Ecology and Sociobiology*. 40:79-86.
- Cole, B. J. and D. C. Wiernasz. 1999. The selective advantage of low relatedness. *Science* 285: 891-893.

- Cole, B. J. and D. C. Wiernasz. 2000a. The nature of ant colony success. *Science* 287:1363b.
- Cole, B.J. and D.C. Wiernasz. 2000b. Colony size and reproduction in the western harvester ant, *Pogonomyrmex occidentalis*. *Insectes Sociaux*. 47:249-255.
- Cole, B.J. and D.C. Wiernasz. Submitted. Viability selection on queen size in the western harvester ant, *Pogonomyrmex occidentalis*. (Submitted to *Evolution*)
- Connell, J. H. 1983. On the prevalence and relative importance of interspecific competition: evidence from field experiments. *American Naturalist* 122:661-696.
- Dalling, J.W., S.P. Hubbell, K. Silvera. 1998. Seed dispersal, seedling establishment and gap partitioning among tropical pioneer trees. *Journal of Ecology* 86:674-689.
- Davidson, D. W. 1985. An experimental study of diffuse competition in harvester ants. *American Naturalist*. 125:500-506.
- Davidson, D.W., J.H. Brown, and R.S. Inouye. 1980. Competition and the structure of granivore communities. *BioScience* 30 : 233-238.
- Davidson, D.W., D.A. Samson, R.S. Inouye. 1985. Granivory in the Chihuahuan desert: interactions within and between trophic levels. *Ecology* 66:486-502.
- Denslow, J.S. 1987. Tropical rainforest gaps and tree species diversity. *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics* 18:431-451.
- Denslow, J.S. 1995. Disturbance and diversity in tropical rainforests: the density effect. *Ecological Applications* 5:962-968.
- De Vita, J. 1979. Mechanisms of interference and foraging among colonies of the harvester ant, *Pogonomyrmex californicus* in the Mojave desert. *Ecology* 60:729-734.



- Doherty, P.J. and A. Fowler. 1994. An empirical test of recruitment limitation in a coral reef fish. *Science* 263:935.
- Elton C. 1927. *Animal Ecology*. Sidgwick and Jackson, Ltd., London.
- Gaines, S., S. Brown and J. Roughgarden. 1985. Spatial variation in larval concentrations as a cause of spatial variation in settlement for the barnacle, *Balanus glandula*. *Oecologia* 67:2267-272.
- Gaines, S.D. and M. D. Bertness. 1992. Dispersal of juveniles and variable recruitment in sessile marine species. *Nature* 360:579-580.
- Gordon, D. M. and A.W. Kulig. 1996. Founding, foraging and fighting: colony size and the spatial distribution of harvester and nests. *Ecology* 77:2393-2409.
- Hassell, M. P., J. Latto, and R. M. May. 1989. Seeing the wood for the trees: detecting density dependence from existing life table studies. *Journal of Animal Ecology* 58:883-892.
- Hassell, M. P. and H. B. Wilson. 1997. Parasites, pathogens, and predators in a spatially complex world. Pp. 71-110 in D. Tilman and P. Kareiva, eds. *Spatial Ecology*, Princeton University Press, Princeton, NJ.
- Hölldobler, B. 1976b. The behavioral ecology of mating in harvester ants (Hymenoptera: Formicidae: *Pogonomyrmex*). *Behavioural Ecology and Sociobiology*. 1 : 405-423.
- Hölldobler, B. 1976. Tournaments and slavery in a desert ant. *Science* 192:912-914.
- Hölldobler, B. and E.O. Wilson. 1990. *The ants*. Belknap Press, Cambridge, Mass.
- Hubell, S.P., R. Condit, R.B. Foster. 1990. Presence and absence of density dependence in a neotropical tree community. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London*, B 330:269-281.

- Hubbell, S. P., R. B. Foster, S. T. O'Brien, K. E. Harms, R. Condit, B. Wechsler, S. J. Wright, S. Loo de Lao. 1999. Light-gap disturbances, recruitment limitation, and tree diversity in a neotropical forest. *Science* 283:554-557.
- Hurtt, G.C. and S.W. Pacala. 1995. The consequences of recruitment limitation: reconciling chance, history and competitive differences between plants. *Journal of Theoretical Biology*. 176:1-12.
- Jones, G.P. 1990. The importance of recruitment to the dynamics of a coral reef fish population. *Ecology* 71:1691-1698.
- Kareiva, P. 1990. Population dynamics in spatially complex environments: theory and data. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society, London, B*. 330:175-190.
- Lehman, C. and D. Tilman. 1997. Competition in spatial habitats. D. Tilman and P. Kareiva, (eds), *Spatial ecology*. Princeton Univ. Press, Princeton, N.J. pp. 185-203.
- Levin, S.A. 1992. The problem of pattern and scale in ecology. *Ecology*. 73:1943-1967.
- Levings, S.C., and J.F.A Traniello. 1981. Territoriality, nest dispersion, and community structure in ants. *Psyche* 88 : 265-319.
- Levings, S. C. and N.R. Franks. 1982. Patterns of nest dispersion in a tropical ground ant community. *Ecology* 63:338-344.
- Majer, J.D. 1976b. The influence of ants and ant manipulation on the cocoa farm fauna. *Journal of Animal Ecology*. 157-175.
- Majer, J.D. 1976a. The maintenance of the ant mosaic in Ghana cocoa farms. *Journal of Animal Ecology*. 123-144.

- McIntyre, N.E., J.A. Wiens. 1999. Interactions between habitat abundance and configuration: experimental validation of some predictions from percolation theory. *Oikos* 86:129-137.
- Morin, P. J. 1983. Predation, competition, and the composition of larval anuran guilds. *Ecological Monographs* 53:119-138.
- Munger, J.C. and J.H. Brown 1980. Competition in desert rodents: an experiment with semipermeable exclosures. *Science* 211:510-512.
- Nagel, H. G., and C. W. Rettenmeyer. 1973. Nuptial flights, reproductive behavior and colony founding of the western harvester ant, *Pogonomyrmex occidentalis* (Hymenoptera: Formicidae). *Journal of the Kansas Entomological Society*. 46 : 82-101.
- Pacala, S.W. and J. Silander. 1985. Neighborhood models of plant population dynamics. *American Naturalist* 125:385-411.
- Pacala, S.W. and J. Silander. 1990. Field test of neighborhood population dynamic models of two annual weed species. *Ecological Monographs* 60:113-134.
- Porter, S.D., and D. Savignano. 1990. Invasion of polygyne fire ants decimates native ants and disrupts arthropod community. *Ecology* 71:2095-2106.
- Porter, S.D., B. Van Eimeren and L.E. Gilbert. 1988. Invasion of red imported fire ants: microgeography of competitive replacement. *Annals of the Entomological Society, USA* 81:913-918.
- Possingham, H. P. and J. Roughgarden. 1990. Spatial population dynamics of a marine organism with a complex life cycle. *Ecology* 71:973-985.
- Pulliam, H. R. 1988. Sources, sinks, and population regulation. *American Naturalist* 132:652-661.

- Ray, C. and A. Hastings. 1996. Density dependence: are we searching at the wrong spatial scale? *Journal of Animal Ecology* 65:556-566.
- Roughgarden, J. 1997. Production functions from ecological populations: a survey with emphasis on spatially implicit models. In: Spatial Ecology: the role of space in population dynamics and interspecific interactions. D. Tilman and P. Kareiva (Eds.) Princeton University Press (Princeton, NJ, USA) 296-317.
- Roughgarden, J., S. Gaines and H. Possingham. 1988. Recruitment dynamics in complex life cycles. *Science* 241:1460-1466.
- Roughgarden, J., Y. Iwasa, C. Baxter. 1985. Demographic theory for an open marine population with space-limited recruitment. *Ecology* 66:54-67.
- Roughgarden, J., T. Pennington and S. Alexander. 1994. Dynamics of the rocky intertidal zone with remarks on generalization in ecology. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London, B* 343:79-85.
- Ryti, R. T., and T. J. Case. 1992. The role of neighborhood competition in the spacing and diversity of ant communities. *American Naturalist*. 139 : 355-374.
- Ryti, R. T., and T. J. Case. 1986. Overdispersion of ant colonies: a test of hypotheses. *Oecologia* 69:446-453.
- Ryti, R.T., and T. J. Case. 1984. Spatial arrangement and diet overlap between colonies of desert ants. *Oecologia* 62:401-404.
- Schoener, T.W. 1983. Field experiments on interspecific competition. *American Naturalist* 122:240-285.

- Schup, E.W. 1990. Annual variation in seedfall, postdispersal predation and recruitment of a neotropical tree. *Ecology* 71:504-515.
- Silander, J, and S.W. Pacala. 1985. Neighborhood predictors of plant performance. *Oecologia* 66:256-263.
- Sousa, W. and B.J. Mitchell. 1999. The effect of seed predators on plant distributions: is there a general pattern in mangroves. *Oikos* 86:55-66.
- Stiling, P. 1988. Density-dependent processes and key factors in insect populations. *Journal of Animal Ecology* 57:581-594.
- Strong, D. 1984. Density-vague population ecology and liberal population regulation in insects. In: A new ecology: novel approaches to interactive systems. (P.W. Price, C.N. Slobodchikoff, W.S. Gaud, eds). Wiley, NY. Pp. 313-327.
- Tilman, D. 1982. Resource competition and community structure. Princeton Univ. Press, Princeton, N.J. 296 pp.
- Turchin, P. 1998. Quantitative analysis of movement. Sinauer Associates, Inc., Sunderland, Mass.
- Turchin, P. 1999. Population regulation: a synthetic view. *Oikos* 84:153-159.
- Stoner, D.S. 1990. Recruitment of a tropical colonial ascidian: relative importance of pre-settlement vs. post-settlement processes. *Ecology* 71:1682-1690.
- Vepsäläinen, K. and B. Pisarski. 1982. Assembly of island ant communities. *Annales Zoologici Fennici* 19:327-335
- Warner, R. R. and T. P. Hughes. 1988. The population dynamics of reef fishes. *Proceedings of the 6<sup>th</sup> International Coral Reef Symposium, Townsville* 1:149-155.

- Wellington, G.M. and B.C. Victor. 1985. El Nino mass coral mortality: a test of resource limitation in a coral reef damselfish population. *Oecologia* 68:15-19.
- Wiernasz, D.C. and B.J. Cole. 1995. Spatial distribution of *Pogonomyrmex occidentalis*: recruitment, mortality and overdispersion. *Journal of Animal Ecology*. 64:519-527.
- Wiernasz, D.C., J. Yencharis and B.J. Cole. 1995. Size and mating success in males of the western harvester ant, *Pogonomyrmex occidentalis*. *Journal of Insect Behavior*. 8:523-531.
- Wilkinson, L. 1996. SYSTAT for Windows 6. SYSTAT Inc., Evanston IL.
- Williams D.W. and A.M. Liebhold. 2000. Spatial scale and the detection of density dependence in spruce budworm outbreaks in eastern North America. *Oecologia* 124: 544-552

## Figure Legends

Figure 1a: The number of colonies established on each study plot during 1993-1996 as a function of the number of foundress queens in 1996.

Figure 1b: For the 20 study plots, the number of colonies established on each plot during 1993-1996 as a function of the number of established colonies in 1992.

Figure 1c: For all 92 plots on the entire study site, the number of colonies established on each plot during 1993-1996 as a function of the number of established colonies in 1992. Overlapping points are indicated in this plot by increasing numbers of spikes in the star.

Figure 2a. Colony density in 1992 as a function of distance to the largest hill at the study site.

Figure 2b. Production of first year colonies (1993-1996) as a function of distance to the largest hill at the study site.

Figure 2c. The number of queens landing on a plot (1996) as a function of distance to the largest hill at the study site.

Figure 3: The correlation between the distance between each location in a 1.4 km x 1.4 km area surrounding the study site and the initial colony density in each of the twenty quadrats 1992 (a), first year colonies produced 1993-1996 (b) and the number of queens in 1996 (c). Correlation is coded from +.5 (dark blue) to -0.6 (dark red). Each of the figures points to a region towards the east to northeastern portion of the study area as showing the highest correlation with the density of these life stages. The region of the plot which is simultaneously highly significant ( $P < 0.01$ ) for

all stages (d) contains the tallest hill, (shown as the square symbol). Blue regions indicate locations that are not highly significant ( $P > 0.01$ ) for at least one population parameter.

Figure 4: The relation between colony density and propagule numbers. The solid dots are the plots that are classified as unsaturated. The hollow dots are plots that are classified as saturated plots. The solid lines are the regression of colony density on propagule number while the dashed lines are the expected relations between the two quantities (see text).